



**INTERNATIONAL TRANSPARENCY** AND **CONFERENCE 2021** 



### THANK YOU TO OUR SPONSORS



### **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

ABBREVIATION & ACRONOMY
INTRODUCTION
<u>ABOUT ITAC 2021</u>
THE PURPOSE OF ITAC 2021
PARTICIPANTS, KEY NOTE SPEAKERS, MODERATORS & PANELISTS
ITAC 2021 CONFERENCE ORGANIZERS
CONFERENCE PROCEEDINGS
DAY ONE: FINANCIAL TRANSPARENCY AND ACCOUNTABILITY
SESSION ONE:
SESSION TWO.
SESSION THREE
Breakaway Sessions Day one

### DAY TWO: AFRICAN GOVERNMENTS AND TRANSPARENCY | SOCIAL ACCOUNTABILITY |

CITIZEN ENGAGEMENT   MEDIA RELATIONS   PUBLIC-PRIVATE PARTNERSHIPS	
SESSION FOUR	
SESSION FIVE	33
Breakaway Sessions Day Two	37
CLOSING SESSION	
THE MASTERCLASS (EXPERIENCE SHARING)	44
<u>Annexes</u>	45
ITAC 2021 Conference Takeaways.	45
Evaluation of the Conference	46

### **ABBREVIATION & ACRONOMY**

ITAC	International Transparency and Accountability Conference
AG	Auditor General
CAG	Controller and Auditor General
FCS	Foundation for Civil Society
FBOs	Faith Based Organizations
NRGI	Natural Resource Governance Institute
WCF	Workers Compensation Fund
PF	Policy Forum
NCA	Norwegian Church Aid Tanzania
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
CSO	Civil Society Organization
URT	United Republic of Tanzania
LGA	Local Government Authority
PPP	Public Private Partnership
WAJIBU	WAJIBU-Institute of Public Accountability
GIZ - GFG	German Development Cooperation Good Governance Program

### INTRODUCTION

This is a report of the International Transparency and Accountability Conference (ITAC) 2021 which took place from 18<sup>th</sup> to 19<sup>th</sup>, November 2021, at the Gran Melia Hotel in Arusha, Tanzania. The ITAC 2021 brought together participants from diverse backgrounds that convened to discuss pertinent issues around Transparency and Accountability under the conference theme "Transformation into a Culture of Total Transparency and Accountability". A total of 318 participants attended the conference where by 254 (93 female, 161 male) participated physically while 64 participants participated virtually. Countries which were represented in the ITAC 2021 included Zambia, South Africa, Kenya, Lesotho, Malawi and the host country Tanzania.

The conference was also attended by Government officials from Ministries, Departments and Agencies, Private Sector, Corporate Organizations, Academic Institutions, Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs), Civil Society Organizations (CSOs), Faith Based Organizations (FBOs), Professional Associations and Development Partners.

The modality and methodology adopted at the ITAC 2021 was a participatory and interactive approach, with a purpose of enabling participants to easily follow through and take an active role in the

conference sessions. The breakaway sessions provided participants with more space to learn, digest and share practical experiences and knowledge on a particular topic presented.

This conference contributed in enhancing the capacity of state and nonstate actors to dialogue on public financial accountability matters for improved public financial management in the country. Furthermore, it promoted awareness of citizen on public financial accountability and transparency in the country for improved service delivery, together with influencing changes of weak policies and practices related to public financial management.

This report therefore, provides what transpired during the ITAC 2021 conference. The report articulates the conference proceedings for the entire two days, highlighting in detail the main sessions, plenary sessions and breakaway sessions conducted during the conference.

Furthermore, this report documents the key issues which emerged and the recommendations for advocacy to respective state and non-state actors on building a total culture of transparency and accountability in the country.

### **ABOUT THE ITAC 2021**

The International Transparency and Accountability Conference (ITAC) is a brainchild and flagship signature of WAJIBU, which is purposefully designed to be an annual event with the intention to bring together different strategic stakeholders to discuss, share experiences and recommend on the best ways to collect and utilize public resources in bringing about meaningful and sustainable development of a country. WAJIBU believes that transparency and accountability are critical pathways to poverty reduction and enhancing development.

Based on global trends and practices of transparency and accountability issues and further, considering the importance of the ITAC 2021 in Tanzania, this conference was uniquely designed to ensure that participants actively attend the conference sessions physically as well as virtually.

The 2021 conference theme focused on "Transformation into a culture of total transparency and accountability". This theme provided a broader platform for participants to explore and discuss on issues that impede the flourishing of the culture of transparency and accountability in the country. The conference provided participants with a platform to discuss issues regarding transparency and accountability in the country and explore further mechanisms that will ensure public resources are effectively collected and utilized to bring a meaningful and inclusive development which will benefit all citizens.



A section of the participants following keenly the sessions during the ITAC 2021

### **THE PURPOSE OF THE ITAC 2021**

The main purpose of the International Transparency and Accountability Conference 2021 in Arusha was to provide participants with a high-level overview of the transparency and accountability global trends and practices in the collection and use of public resources. The topics presented focused on the provision of timely, high quality, cost-effective service delivery for citizens by holding duty bearers accountable for their actions.

ITAC 2021 was organized to incorporate a variety of well-planned sessions integrating global trends, best practices, success stories, case studies, panel discussions, delivered by highly qualified and competent resource persons from diverse backgrounds in order to promote interdisciplinary learning and help in hastening the transformation process thereby ushering our society into a total culture of transparency and accountability.

### PARTICIPANTS, KEY NOTE SPEAKERS, MODERATORS & PANELISTS

### **Participants**

ITAC 2021 considered the aspect of demographic representations of various social groups, whereby, participants' profiles included among others, youth, women, men, senior citizens, religious leaders and people with disability. Participation to the conference was based on a cost sharing model, whereby, participants were required to cover for their costs associated with transports, evening meals and accommodation, while, the conference organizers covered for the participants' conference fees, which included lunch, tea breaks and the venue through a sponsorship method. Organizations that contributed and sponsored directly and/or in kind to the conference costs were; GIZ - GFG, German Cooperation, Foundation for Civil Society, Royal Norwegian Embassy, HAKIRASILIMALI, Policy Forum, Natural Resource Governance Institute, Workers Compensation Fund, and the Norwegian Church Aid

### Key note speakers, Moderators and Panelists,

The key note speakers, moderators, panelists and discussants, played significant roles in the success of the ITAC 2021. This team comprised of very competent resource persons, possessing extensive knowledge and experience in their subject matter presented. These people were key in ensuring that the content of the respective topic(s) was easily delivered, digested and understood by participants. They also facilitated in shaping the discussions thereby enabling participants to follow through and obtain the gist of the topics presented. Their names and topics that were presented during the conference will be presented in the next pages of this report.

### THE ITAC CONFERENCE ORGANIZERS

WAJIBU is a reputable intellectual leadership institution founded with the purpose of supporting and promoting an environment of public financial accountability in Tanzania. Given this responsibility, WAJIBU embarked on a broader mission of organizing the ITAC annually to discuss various topics on transparency and accountability matters in the country.

It is imperative and prudent for WAJIBU to acknowledge and recognize the considerable financial, moral and material support that was received from various sponsors/donors which enormously contributed in making the ITAC 2021 a reality.

### **CONFERENCE PROCEEDINGS**

The conference proceedings provide a summary of the ITAC 2021 events and activities that transpired in the course of the two days of the conference. This part articulates and covers the speeches, presentations and discussions which took place during the conference sessions, ranging from the opening ceremony, main sessions, breakout sessions, to the closing session. The activities reported under this part are sequentially arranged to cover the day one deliberations followed by day two proceedings.



A section of the participants following keenly the sessions during the ITAC 2021



## SESSIO

### DAY ONE

### DAY ONE: FINANCIAL TRANSPARENCY AND ACCOUNTABILITY

Financial transparency and accountability was the main topic of day one. The topic provided



The session chair Ms. Getrude Mugizi (C) listening to CPA. Benjamin Majura (L) and CPA. Neema Kiure (R) during the panel discussion of ITAC 2021 on 18th November, 2021 at Gran Melia Hotel, Arusha

the content and direction of all presentations and discussions conducted for the entire day. Activities for day one commenced with the opening ceremony which marked the official opening of ITAC 2021. This event was graced by the Guest of Honour, Hon. John Mongela, the Regional Commissioner for Arusha Region, who represented the Hon. Minister for Finance and Planning, Dr. Mwigulu Nchemba (MP). Activities of day one are briefly articulated hereunder; -

### **Opening Ceremony**

The opening ceremony marked the official opening of ITAC 2021, This event attracted several remarks from representatives from various organizations, followed by the speech of the guest of honour as explained below;

The first welcoming remarks were given by the Chairman of WAJIBU Board of Directors - CPA Yona Killagane. In his welcoming remarks<sup>1</sup>, the chairperson began by cordially welcoming all participants (physical and virtual) to the conference. He further touched on the Country's Annual State of Financial Accountability Report (CASFAR) 2019/20 which showed the state of public financial accountability in Tanzania for the fiscal year 2019/20. Commenting on the CASFAR report findings, the WAJIBU chairperson indicated that, Tanzania scored an overall grade of C+ which is equivalent to 50%. He commended the government for the considerable progress made, and additionally urged and recommended for the government to undertake further improvement on the country's state of financial accountability, particularly on key areas related in supporting economic recovery, national debt management, improving budget reliability, transparency and accountability

of public finances, improvement on public investment management and finally cementing on improvement of policybased fiscal strategy and budgeting. Mr. Killagane thanked the sponsors of the conference and welcomed them to give their remarks on the conference.

- ☐ The GIZ GFG representative Ms. Nieke Pasch was the first sponsor to take the podium whereby she conveyed her gratitude and congratulatory remarks to WAJIBU for a good work done in organising the conference. She further emphasised on the need and importance of ITAC 2021 to discuss on the importance of transparency and accountability on the management of public resources in the country. She said transparency and accountability are important tools in ensuring that public resources are managed well to benefit all the citizens. She finally affirmed continued cooperation from GIZ in future ITACs.
- Advocate Francis Kiwanga from the Foundation for Civil Society, followed in the list of sponsors, He echoed his gratitude and congratulated WAJIBU for the milestone and considerable achievements attained in a span of its five (5) years of existence. He recalled how WAJIBU started as a small organisation with very few staff and grew into becoming an impactiful organisation, conducting capacity building and training to other NGOs. He said, this fast development pace has made WAJIBU to attain reputation and recognition at the national and international level. He finally, called on WAJIBU to keep on influencing and championing the transparency and accountability agenda in the country.
- ☐ The NRGI was represented by Ms. Sophia Rwegellera, where she began by expressing her gratitude for being part of the ITAC 2021. She further commended WAJIBU for an excellent

<sup>1</sup> The full text of speech as delivered by the board chairperson is annexed to this report

accomplishment in organising such a successful international conference. She further reiterated on the need for continued efforts on spearheading the transparency and accountability agenda in the country, adding that, transparency and accountability are significant key tools which require a unique attention for building a healthy, stronger and accountable nation.

- The final remarks in the opening ceremony were made by the Guest of Honour, Hon. John Mongela, the Regional Commissioner for Arusha Region. The guest of honour began by welcoming participants to the ITAC 2021 and to the beautiful City of Arusha. He further conveyed greetings from Hon. Dr. Mwigulu Lameck Nchemba (MP), Minister for Finance and Planning, who was supposed to open the conference on behalf of Hon. Dr. Phillip Mpango, the Vice President of the United Republic of Tanzania.
- They both could not make it to the ITAC 2021 due to unavoidable cirumstances they had. In his speech<sup>2</sup>, the Hon. John Mongela expressed his excitement for the ITAC 2021. He said, "he is happy that WAJIBU chose to conduct the conference in Arusha". Hon. Mongela congratulated CPA. Ludovick Utouh, the Executive Director of WAJIBU and the Board of Directors of WAJIBU for establishing WAJIBU in 2015. He said WAJIBU has grown into becoming one of the most respectable and reliable intellectual leadership institutions on public financial accountability in the country.



Guest of Honour, Hon. John Mongela's remarks during the opening ceremony of ITAC 2021 on 18th November, 2021 at Gran Melia Hotel, Arusha

<sup>2</sup> The full speech of the guest of honour is available to this report as annex

He further commended the remarkable job done by WAJIBU to organize such a historical International Conference on Transparency and Accountability in Tanzania. He went on to elaborated on the importance of ITAC 2021, by pointing out the need for citizens to engage and discuss on transparency and accountability issues, sharing best practices, successes and challenges in order to promote an interdisciplinary learning environment in promoting the culture of total transparency and accountability in the country. Commenting on the theme for the ITAC 2021, the guest of honour underscored the need for a country to embrace a culture of transparency and accountability, as well as, responsible authorities to see the need of creating a conducive and enabling environment to enable citizens to take an active role in spearheading the accountability agenda.

Hon. Mongela also articulated on the importance of Transparency and Accountability in a country, mentioning it as a key and an impetus to sustainable development. He further pointed out that Transparency and Accountability constitutes important elements of good governance that Tanzania stands for. He went on to show that, citizens have the right and duty to demand for transparency and accountability from their leaders for that matter, it is their constitutional right to do so, as enshrined under Article 8 (c); Article 9 (i); and Article 27 (2) of the Constitution of the United Republic of Tanzania (URT) of 1977 (as amended from time to time).

Hon. Mongela dwelt on the historical perceptive of Tanzania's journey towards transparency and accountability, describing the roles of various phases of leadership in the process of creating structures, institutions and enactment of laws and policies to support the existence of governance structures in the country. Hon. Mongela went further to describe the challenges which emerged later due to the absence of people centered accountability. Most citizens felt left out with structural reforms and hence were disconnected. Moreover, the transformation did not seem to touch on the undertaken efforts which resulted in improving lives of the people on social services such as water, education, energy and health. In addition, vices such as corruption and misuse of public resources were on the rise. This is what called for a new perceptive and holistic approach in bringing people at the center of transparency and accountability, he said. Hon, Mongela urged, for a dipper and broader cooperation among the citizens, CSOs and government, so that the transparency and accountability agenda can succeed to became a reality in Tanzania. After saying that, Hon. Mongela then declared the conference open.

### The session highlights – Key note speaker, Discussant and Moderator/Chairperson

**Topic:** Independence of Country's Audit function and its Impact on Transparency and Accountability in the Changing Scenarios of Internal and External Auditing Principles and Practices.

**The Plenary Panel:** This session was chaired by Ms. Gertrude Mugyizi from Rhodes University -South Africa, the panelists for the session included Dr. Neema Kiure - Managing Partner of Ernest & Young - Tanzania, who was the key note speaker. CPA. Benja Majura, Deputy Auditor General, National Audit Office of Tanzania, played the role of discussant.

### THE BRIEF OVERVIEW OF THE PANELIST PRESENTATIONS AND KEY ISSUES RAISED

This session explored broadly on issues related to the independence of Tanzanian' audit functions, navigating through structures, principles, practices and challenges which are likely to impact on the transparency and accountability in the country's context. The speakers described considerable key issues that are critical for the success of the country's transformation into a culture of transparency and accountability, emphasizing among other things on the role of citizens engagement in the accountability and transparency processes at all levels. The panelists further asserted on the need for the government to broaden and promote transparency in all spheres, commenting further that, auditing reports and other related public information should be made publicly accessible to enable citizens

have access to them and encourage them to actively participate in following up of the public revenue collection and expenditures. The speakers further intimated that, the auditing function is a legal requirement as indicated and enshrined in the articles 143 and 144 of constitution of the United Republic of Tanzania 1977 (as amended from time to time).







### Key issues which emerged from Session One.

During the presentations and discussions, several key issues transpired and were recorded as summarized hereunder, that; -

- The role of the audit function in the public sector is to audit and report to responsible authorities as required by the Constitution and other related laws of the country. The focus of modern audit function should be results oriented rather than outputs due to changing context.
- ☐ There is a need to have capable and stronger Parliamentary Oversight Committees that will put pressure on the government and ensure the CAG's recommendations are implemented as presented.
- Ethics constitutes a considerable ingredient in the function of the audit; thus, ethical conduct should be a concern of every citizen. Ethical conduct needs to be promoted and encouraged by families from early ages, since governments can only enact ethical codes of conduct but will not be able to guarantee someone's behavior.
- Principles of public sector governance includes among others, setting direction, installing ethics, overseeing results, accountability reporting and taking corrective measures. Governance principles constitutes key aspects of public sector which leads to enhancement of performance in the public sector and ultimately impacts on transparency, accountability, integrity and equity on the collection and use of public resources.
- The role of external audit function in the public sector in the country is in accordance with Article 143 of the Constitution of the United Republic of Tanzania which creates the position of the Controller and Auditor General (CAG) whereas the Public Audit Act No. 6 of 2008 creates the office of the National Audit Office of Tanzania (NAOT) Other related functions and powers of the CAG are clearly elaborated under the Public Audit Act No. 6 2008. The constitution further provides for termination and cessation of the CAG. Article 144 of the constitution of the URT provides the procedures for the appointment of the CAG and the procedures to be followed in terminating the CAG's appointment should need warrant. The provisions in Article 144 of the constitution is amplified in the Public Audit Act No 6 of 2008 and the Public Audit Regulations of 2009. The aspect of parliamentary accountability was also an issue of concern in the discussion as to whether the parliament should be accountable to the citizens or to the executive. This also raised a pertinent question as to whether citizens knew their powers to demand/hold the parliament and the Members of Parliament accountable.
- □ Another issue which emerged was on the need for the public and private sector to shift from the old modal of line of defense for the audit function which gives the internal audit function the third line of defense reporting to management and the Board of Director's audit committee, to a new model which gives the internal audit function the mandate to be accountable and reporting to the Board of Directors through its Audit Committee and align, communication, coordination and collaboration with the management.

- It was also noted that, there is a low and insufficient knowledge among critical stakeholders, the parliamentarians and citizens on the work of both external as well as internal auditors which has significantly led to inactive move from the citizens and parliaments to effectively exercising their oversight powers to influence transparency and accountability in the public financial management system.
- □ It was further observed that, there has been an increase in demand for audit nowadays from various stakeholders due to increased citizen awareness coupled with various reasons which influence its relevance to the public.



A section of the participants following keenly the sessions during the ITAC 2021





Adv. Francis Kiwanga moderating the second session during the ITAC 2021 on 18th November 2021 at Gran Melia Hotel, Arusha.

### The session highlights - Key note speaker, Discussants and Chairperson

**Topic:** Financial Transparency and Accountability as a Tool for African Countries to achieve sustainable competitive advantage in the global economy.

**The Plenary Panel:** This session was chaired and moderated by Adv. Francis Kiwanga from Foundation for Civil Society; the panel was constituted of Prof. Honest Ngowi, - Principal at Mzumbe University, Dar es Salaam Campus, who was the Key note Speaker, and other two speakers were, Ms. Joyce Nkini-Iwisi Principal, Head of Investigations Africa, Control Risk, based in South Africa, and Bishop Nelson Kisare, Head Bishop, Mennonite Church of Tanzania and Chairman of the Interfaith Standing Committee under the Christian Council of Tanzania.

### BRIEF OVERVIEW OF THE PANEL PRESENTATIONS AND KEY ISSUES WHICH EMERGED

The keynote speaker, Prof. Prosper Ngowi, made a presentation on Transparency and Accountability as important tools for the country to achieve competitive advantage and positive score on the global markets. In his presentation he articulated that, transparency and accountability increase confidence to investors who could develop an interest to invest in numerous projects or sectors in the county. He further added that, citizens have a great role to play in the broader aspect of tax arena, that, they need to be encouraged to pay taxes as required by laws of the land and, they should equally demand for transparency and accountability from their leaders to provide them with explanation on the collection and use of public funds entrusted to them. He articulated further that, since taxes are public funds, thus, the government is required to adhere to the constitution and national laws which require display of public funds expenditures, loans and debts to the public so that citizens are aware and informed on how the public funds are utilized<sup>1</sup>.

The second presentation was done by Ms. Joyce Nkini-Iwisi, who described on the importance of CAG in Tanzania and the Auditor General for the case of South Africa, and their fundamental role in furtherance of the transparency and accountability agenda. The presenter provided a broader view of narration of how South Africa took a bold move to enact various laws which are conferring powers to the Auditor General to enable him to supervise, control and audit public funds from any kind of misuse. Drawing from the various laws enacted by Parliament, she mentioned them to include, the Anonymous Act (2018) which confers powers to the Auditor General to enable for misuses of public funds, the law equally empowers the Audit General to instruct any agency which has embezzled public funds to pay back the amount embezzled. She further added that, another piece of law enacted is the Public Audit Amendment Act (2018), which empowers and authorises the

<sup>1</sup> The full text of presentation will be available as annex to this presentation

Auditor General to hold specific government officials responsible for financial irregularities which may have led to the loss of public funds.

The presenter further articulated on the role of the media in the transparency and accountability agenda, describing its use and relevance to this impeccable agenda. She touched on South Africa as a case, where mainly cases related to theft and misuse of public funds by public or governmental officials were exposed and brought to iustice. Speaking about the power and role of the media, she drew a case of South Africa under the administration of the former President of South Africa Mr. Jacob Zuma, who was investigated and reported by the media on public funds embezzlement. The media as well, revealed a state capture network of unscrupulous individuals including the Gupta brothers who occupied influential positions in the government and used the same to their advantage in siphoning the much needed public resources. The presenter concluded by emphasizing on the need for empowering the Controller and Auditor General's office of Tanzania, she said that, the CAG office role should not only be on conducting monitoring and reporting on the use of public funds but should as well be authorised with powers to hold some institutions or individuals accountable when it is revealed that some irregularities or acts of misuses or embezzlement of public funds have been intentionally committed.

The third presentation in the panel was made by Bishop Nelson Kisare, who described the significance of transparency and accountability for the growth and development of our families and country at large. He further narrated on the need for families to invest in people and cultivate ethical conduct in children while at their early ages. The presenter further provided his perspective of the subject matter from religious perceptive, quoting from the Bible, reading in the book of Acts, chapter 5, Verse 1 to 10. He read and narrated the story of Ananias and Sapphira who had sold their plot of land but conspired to unveil the actual amount of the true price of the sold land to Peter, consequently, they both died on the spot. He articulated that, the couple lacked transparency and accountability to the extent that they conspired to cheat God, and as a result they both lost their lives. The presenter went on to describe that, the Ananias and Sapphira's story is a relevant story today and provided us with a lesson to learn in todays' world.

He further added that, transparency and accountability need to be seen and exercised by the government as the sole custodian of the public resources, emphasizing that, Government should limit borrowing to avoid repayment consequences that will be detrimental to the future generations. He further insisted that, on the same spirit of transparency and accountability, borrowers must be held to account to establish on how the loans had been utilized. Moreover, he called upon leaders and those in powers to diligently serve the people to whom they promised to serve, stressing that, **"if you're a** *leader and yet abusing and misusing your position, you are no longer fit for public position*" He went on to pose a question that, if transparency and accountability was to be measured in the same way as used to be in the era of Ananias and Sapphire, how many of us would survive? He finally concluded by emphasizing on the need for citizens and leaders to uphold God's principles to avoid doing wrongs.

The presenters' presentations and remarks, paved the way for the moderator/ chairperson of the session to invite participants from the floor to the next session of questions and answers and eventually, responses were made by the panelists which concluded the session.

#### Key issues which emerged from session two.

The key issues as summarized and presented in this session are from the keynote speakers, panelists, participants' contributions and presentations. Key issues emerged from session two are; -

- Citizens should take an active role in paying taxes and demanding for the government to respond and be accountable on public resources management on their behalf.
- Transparency and accountability are among key determinants of investments, trade inflows and investor retention in the country, hence, there is a need to create a conducive environment for the flourishing of the same.
- There is a need for the government to enhance transparency and accountability in its plans and put financial information widely accessible for public consumption since it's the tax payer's money. The acts of transparency and accountability increases public trust and confidence of donors and investors and trust of the public in their government.
- ☐ Financial transparency and accountability increase competitiveness in the current global market hence it should be encouraged by reducing corruption and mismanagement of public resources.
- Transparency and accountability increase easiness of citizens in paying taxes and be responsible to take part in the government's development initiatives due to the trust they have in the government system.
- Transparency and accountability should be nurtured and cultivated in children at early ages to enable them growing up knowing that they have a role in preserving public resources.
- Religious leaders have significant roles to play in molding, teaching, warning, admonishing, reprimanding and directing believers, non-believers, leaders and citizens alike to

act righteousness in ensuring that public resources are effectively utilized to the best interest of all people and the county at large.

- Oversight institutions and public participation is key for perpetual enhancement of transparency and accountability in the collection and use of public resources. They have considerable roles to play in ensuring that public resources are legally and equally important. In this crusade the civil society organizations and the media have a considerable role to play in ensuring that duty bearers practice the concept of transparency, accountability and good governance in handling of public resources.
- □ While the CAG is a creature of the Constitution of the URT, yet, there is a need to enact a law which shall confer more powers on the CAG to have biting teeth in holding accountable those duty bearers responsible for the misuse of public resources including, individuals and organisations a like.
- ☐ There is a need to encourage effective use of modern technology in ensuring that the concepts of transparency and accountability are well understood by the public at all levels and in different areas. This may include the use of appropriate software and popular social media platforms such as Tweeter, Instagram, face book and other gateways available.



### The session highlights – Key note speaker, Discussants and Chairperson

**Topic:** Effectiveness of Information and Communication Technology in Enhancing Public Financial Transparency and Accountability in Africa

**The Plenary Panel:** This session took off immediately after the lunch break. The session focused on effectiveness of Information and communication Technology in enhancing public financial transparency and accountability in Africa. The key Note Speaker was Mr. Nuzulack Dausen, CEO & Executive Editor, Nukta Africa. Discussant of the session was Mr. Kenneth Wakati, Country Head, Techno Brain – Tanzania. The session was chaired by Mr. Semkae Kilonzo CEO- Policy Forum – Tanzania.

### THE OVERVIEW OF THE PANEL PRESENTATIONS AND ISSUES WHICH EMERGED THEREFROM;

The main question that the speakers was required to address was whether and how ICT could promote or enhance transparency and accountability? The key note Speaker, Mr. Nuzulack Dausen, begun by describing the importance of ICT and technology in general in enhancing transparency and accountability highlighting on how ICT has made it easy for information to travel and reach the intended audience faster, drawing examples from Tanzania, he pointed out on how Ministries, Municipalities and District Councils have been utilizing available online platforms to inform and deliver various communiqués to the public on various developmental programmes. He further elaborated on four key areas that ICT can be useful to enhance transparency and accountability, the areas include, budget preparations and scrutiny, revenue collection and expenditure tracking, transparency in procurement process, monitoring and feedback mechanism in budgeting management and detection and management and mitigation of financial risks.

Stressing on budget preparations and scrutiny; the presenter described how ICT transformation has made it possible for the government to use ICT to enhance citizens' participation in the budget processes through opinion gathering process and the like. He went on to emphasize that, ICT could be used by the government as an online platform for citizens to question government or raise issues of their concern on national priorities. ICT could further be used to fast track flow of information between the government, citizens, CSOs and the Media, more so, ICT could be useful in reducing time and costs associated with budget preparation. Regarding revenue collection and expenditure tracking, the presenter highlighted that, ICT has become a useful tool in processing online payments, he thus echoed for the government to adopt such tool in the accomplishment of a number of activities including, managing control of all payments through established portals, tracking all payments done and reducing human direct intervention in the payment systems which eventually reduces by far the opportunities for corruptions or bribery. He went on to comment that: ICT is useful in fast tracking delivery of public services to citizens and reduces government operational costs in service provisions.

On transparency in the procurement process, the presenter emphasized that ICT has facilitated an online procurement procedure, where all tenders, suppliers awarded and tender amounts can easily be captured and tracked online. The presenter finally, commented that, using ICT, monitoring and feedback mechanism in budget management has been made possible; also, detection, management and mitigation of financial risks can now be easily and promptly traced.

Mr. Kenneth Wakati, was the next speaker who played a role of discussant. He equally echoed and built on what the key note speaker had presented. His emphasis was more on improvement of public

service delivery, where he emphasized on the need for the public sector to transform its service delivery mode, highlighting further on the potential that is embedded within ICT as enabler in the creation of value of services delivered. He also commended on the initiatives that the government has been taking towards improvement and use of ICT, drawing an example of TRA and the automation that has been effected to facilitate provision of online services to customers which has significantly reduced the number of customers being required to physically visit TRA offices in order to obtain the required services. He further went on to recommend to the government to continue embracing automation in ICT in order to take an advantage of value creation in the services, he particularly stressed on the need for, the government to pay attention on information management for performance and security, in order to assure that all the data collected from the various sources are protected and used for the intended purposes.

The presenter proposed for the government to continue designing and developing pertinent programmes and provide technological solutions which are compatible and which will cater for the needs of the users. He also, described on the need for the government to enhance engagement with the users – citizens, that, the government needs to create programmes and applications which are compatible and user friendly to most users. He further encouraged the government to seek for feedback from the users of the ICT tools and measurement of the impact delivered from the use of the ICT investment.

The remarks by the discussant, Mr. Wakati, ushered in a brief session of questions from participants which were responded to by the presenters.

### Key issues which emerged from Session Three

The key issues presented hereunder were derived from the presentations made by speakers and participant's contributions from the panel discussions during the session;

- There is a need to build a perpetual culture of transparency and accountability among the civil servants, this should be incorporated and mainstreamed into the programmes, plans and modalities of work.
- ☐ There must be an affirmative action taken by the government to bridge digital divide between people living in rural and urban areas, poor and the rich, so that they may all have access to ICT services as a right and not a privilege.
- There is a need to encourage and support ICT Innovation that will be accessible and inclusive for all people including People with Disabilities (PWD) and the innovation should be customized to reflect the need and context of the local environment.
- ☐ There is a need for the government to support enactment of laws which are proactive and friendly enough to support digital transformation.
- It's further advised for the regular updates of government websites, social media pages and dashboards to enable citizens to access updated information as they come on regular basis.
- There is a need of increasing digital literacy rate among the citizens particularly on the use of ICT in social and economic activities; this can be possible if the government will work closely with the private sector, CSOs and development partners.

It is important that there is a need to build a total culture of transparency and accountability for the citizens to demand transparency and accountability on the collection and use of public finances from the respective authorities; this can be possible through citizen's engagement and awareness creation on the same.

#### **Breakaway Sessions Day one**

The breakaway sessions took place immediately after the plenary sessions were concluded. There were three breakaway sessions conducted which were all held concurrently in different rooms under different topics. This part therefore, highlights in a nut shell what transpired during the breakaway sessions, covering the topics and the key issues which emerged in the course of the sessions.

### **BREAKAWAY SESSION 01A:**

**The topic:** The need for African Leaders to break from traditional ways of doing things and get into more modern forms of effective management practices.

**The Session Panel**: The panel for this session comprised of Key note speaker, CPA Godfrey Mramba, Managing Partner and CEO, Basil & Alred Tanzania, Bishop Nelson Kisare - Chairman Interfaith Standing Committee -CCT, who played a role of Discussant, and the session was chaired by Advocate Francis Kiwanga, Executive Director of FCS.

### Overview of the presentation and the key issues which emerged

The key note speaker, CPA Mramba, started by posing some mind intriguing questions on why change is needed, he went on to describe that, change is inevitable because we have been doing things for many years in the same way and we need to change for the better and also, we have been struggling with the same issues in a long period of time hence, change is necessary. He further added that, colonialism has contributed in a big way on how African's act, that, despite the attainment of independence years ago, yet, so much has not changed to date.

He emphasized that for African countries to have a total change, Government should embark on the following,



CPA. Mramba presenting a paper during the ITAC 2021 on 18th November 2021 at Gran Melia Hotel, Arusha.

- ☐ Change our Leadership styles; which include the way we see things in a big picture and goals setting which need to be attainable irrespective of various challenges encountered.
- Embrace technology as a way of life and mainstream it in our daily programmes and plans, and make it work at national, regional and individual level.
- Embrace and practice transparency and accountability, which will result on the duty bearer becoming more responsible. There is a need for government to facilitate accessibility of information so that citizens may have access to the same and through that be able to hold duty bearers accountable.

On his part, Bishop Nelson Kisare elaborated that, the era of autocratic leadership is no longer in existence, that, currently any meaningful leadership should be participatory where people share their knowledge and find solutions to challenges together. Adding further that, leaders need to know what is required of them before assuming power. He also pointed out that, a good leadership trait encourages people to participate in decision making from the grassroot to the national level. Good leadership also recruits people based on merit and competence and not based on nepotism or tribalism.

Bishop Kisare, further commented that, for any type of leadership to make sense, it must consider among other things, mentorship and coaching, so as to prepare others in the succession plan. It also must consider reward as motivation for best performers and sanctions for poor performers however, the rewards need to be transparent to avoid biasness, and finally, citizens need to get feedback on what transpired on a regular basis.

### Key issues noted from this session

Key issues that emerged during the session includes the following, that,

- ☐ There is a need to embrace a couple of things to bring an impactful leadership in Africa, including, change in African Political Systems, change country's constitutions to reflect the context reality, build strong independent oversight Institutions and not strong people.
- There is a need for African countries to redefine their transparency and accountability agenda so as to reflect with the improved approach practices in the developed countries. This will contribute on changing the traditional practices of public financial management.

#### **BREAKAWAY SESSION 01B:**

**The Topic:** Citizen Engagement in implementing, monitoring and reporting in the use of public funds.

**The Session Panel:** The panel involved Mr. Chimuka Nachibinga from Transparency International, Zambia, who was a Key Note Speaker and the RT. REV. Augustine Shao, C.P.P.S, Catholic Bishop Diocese of Zanzibar, Interfaith Standing Committee TEC, who played the role of discussant, and the session was chaired by Ms. Rehema Tukai – Program Lead – Strengthening Civil Society from the Norwegian Church Aid.

### The Overview of the presentation and the key issues noted from the session

This session intended to provide insights to participants on matters related to citizen engagement and participation in the governance process. The session further aimed at enhancing capacities and knowledge of participants on how best they can create a strong link between duty-bearers, service providers and citizens. The key note speaker, Mr. Chumuka, touched on key issues of governance, including Social Accountability, Citizens Participation, Budget Monitoring, Expenditure Tracking and Advocacy and discussed on useful tools used in Monitoring Policy Priorities, Budget Allocation and Budgetary Processes.



A section of the Participants keenly following the session deliberations during the ITAC 2021 on 18th November, 2021 at Gran Melia Hotel, Arusha.

Articulating on social accountability, he described that, this is a citizen-led action to hold public officials and service providers to account for the use of public resources and services delivered. Social accountability provides an avenue for citizens to exercise their constitutional right to participate in decisions and processes concerning their own development. He also described on citizens participation as citizen involvement in public decision making, which may also means that citizens exercise influence and control over the decisions that affect them.

Mr. Chimuka further elaborated on the role and importance of CSOs and citizens to effectively participate in the process of the national budget to ensure that public resources are utilized as planned. Drawing example from Zambia, he explained how citizen engagement in implementation, monitoring and reporting in the use of public funds is done in Zambia. He further clarified that, in Zambia the system of citizen participation in the country's budget processes is very clear and CSOs engage the citizens fully through the decentralization policy. He also described that; the decentralization policy gives room for CSOs to get involved in the national budget process.

He finally, illustrated on tools for monitoring policy priorities, budget allocations and budgetary process, mentioning them to include, formulation of alternative budgets (consultative process), budget review and analysis (budget review, analysis and simplification) and demystification of the budget. On the tools for monitoring budget implementation, he touched on public expenditure tracking surveys and social audit and the citizen's right to information and monitoring of procurement processes. Furthermore, he concluded his presentation by touching on the tools to monitor development outcomes which include among others integrity pacts, citizen report cards (CRC) and community score cards (CSC). On his part, RT.REV. Augustine Shao, while dicussing the key note presentation, he commented on the need to consolidate culture of moral credibility on transparency and accountability from the family level to the national level. He also urged on the need for open dialogue from grassroot level concerning transparency and accountability to national level, where, various matters related to public resources need to be discussed. He further added that, citizen engagement in the country's budgetary process, should involve capacity building and awareness creation of the community so that they can take responsibility on follow up and monitoring the process.

#### Key issues which imerged from the session

The following represent selected key issues which emerged during the session

- Capacity building for citizens is necessary but should be complemented by institutional reforms.
- Participatory planning should be linked with national budget decisions making process.
- CSOs should come up with acceptable advocacy approaches that will entice the government to give positive response rather than opposing everything the government does.
- ☐ There is a need to start empowering the younger generation in understanding the effects of accepting and giving bribes in their day to day lives starting from primary schools and at the family level.
- Budget analysis and advocacy should be combined with better mapping of poverty issues and a greater focus on specific sectors for budget review should be planned before engagement in the budgeting process

- Building Institutional capacity should be included in the country's program design to sustain effective citizens' engagement and to effect policy changes
- Collaborative environment should be cultivated between community and government to create improved public engagement.

### **BREAKAWAY SESSION 01C:**

**The Topic:** The critical role of Digital (Crypto) Currency in Africa in Public Financial Accountability.

**The Session Panel:** The panel for this session brought together CPA Sandra Chogo from the National Audit Office - Tanzania as a Key note speaker and Ms. Getrude Mugyizi from Rhodes University, South Africa who played the role of Chair of the session.

### Overview of the presentation and key issues noted in the session

The main intention behind this session was to create awareness to the participants on the Crypto currencies which is a new experience to most of the people in Tanzania and Africa at large. This session was facilitated by CPA. Sandra Chogo, who took time to articulate and explain to the participants about various concepts used within the sphere of Digital (Crypto) Currency. Her presentation touched on several issues including clearing the confusion among the participants between the term block chain, bitcoin and crypto currency. She further articulated on the evolution of digital wallets from one generation to the other.

In her presentation, she described that the world has been experiencing a drastic shift from traditional wallets to digital wallets through digital transformation; she further added that, the Digital wallets hold digital currencies which includes Cryptocurrency and Central Bank Digital Currencies (CBDC). Also, Digital currency is a form of currency that is available only in digital or electronic form and accessible with computers and mobile phone only. It is also called digital money, electronic money, electronic currency, or cyber cash. She stressed further that, Digital currency can be transformed into cash in hand, if necessary, by withdrawing cash from any ATM, bank, mobile money etc., however, all cryptocurrencies are digital currencies but not all digital currencies are cryptocurrencies.



CPA. Sandra Chogo from the National Audit Office - Tanzania giving her presentation during the ITAC 2021 on 19th November 2021 at Gran Melia Hotel, Arusha.

#### Key issues which imerged from this session

The main issues gathered from this session include the following;

- The Bitcoin cryptocurrency is the first application of the block chain which is a digital representation of value.
- ☐ The evolution of this type of currency has involved considerable laps from barter coins to paper currency, to plastic money and now to cryptocurrency
- Crypto currency is more secure as block chain track and move highly encrypted (cryptography) and distributed nodes for bitcoin network.
- Cryptocurrency reduces transaction fees and cost; that is, less transaction fees, transactions are not affected by foreign exchange changes (cryptocurrencies can be used globally without exchanging them), service fees, monthly fees & foreign exchange costs for bank transaction.
- There is a need to equip ourselves with the required skills and understanding of cryptocurrency innovation as quickly as we can and become proactive and not reactive.

### PLENARY DISCUSSION - DEBRIFING BY BREAKAWAY SESSIONS CHAIRS

This plenary discussion followed the conclusion of the breakaway sessions and also signified the end of day one deliberations. This debriefing session was designed to provide chairs who presided over different breakaway sessions with a platform to present in a nutshell what was agreed in their respective breakaway sessions. The overall objective of the plenary discussion was to share key issues and messages that emerged in the different breakaway sessions to the rest of the participants who had attended different breakaway sessions. During the plenary session, each presiding chair had some few minutes to present before the audience on the key issues which were discussed and agreed under each topic. The key issues presented by the chairs in the plenary discussions, have been presented above under the category of key issues which emerged from the session.

## SESSION FOUR

### DAY TWO

### AFRICAN GOVERNMENTS AND TRANSPARENCY | SOCIAL ACCOUNTABILITY | CITIZEN ENGAGEMENT | MEDIA RELATIONS | PUBLIC-PRIVATE PARTNERSHIPS



Prof. PLO Lumumba address during the ITAC 2021 on 19th November 2021 at Gran Melia Hotel, Arusha.

# The session highlights - Key note speaker, Discussants and Chairperson

Day two of the ITAC 2021 began by a brief recap, highlighting activities which took place on day one. The recap was conducted by the event moderator – Mr. Anthony Luvanda, who took participants through the key activities which transpired on the previous day.

### **Topic:** Have African Government been sufficiently transparent and accountable in addressing the COVID-19 pandemic?

**The Plenary Panel:** The panel for this session comprised of Prof. Patrick Loch Otieno Lumumba from Kenya, who played the role of key note speaker and Ms. Joyce Nkini-Lwisi, Principal / Head of Investigations Africa, Control Risk, South Africa, who was the discussant for the respective topic. The session was chaired and moderated by Getrude Mugyizi, from Rhodes University – South Africa.

### OVERVIEW OF THE PANEL PRESENTATIONS AND ISSUES WHICH EMERGED THEREAFTER

Prof. Patrick Loch Otieno Lumumba gave a powerful speech with highlight of transparency and accountability on the challenges that faced the international community and the African Governments in the commitment and responses on dealing with the COVID-19 pandemic. He highlighted considerable issues which African leaders are grappling with including the COVID-19 pandemic, hence, called on African leaders to see a need of coming together to address those challenges as one team instead of addressing them separately. He further commented on the lack of transparency and accountability by African states, which results on failure to unveil accurate expenditures on funds and other assistance received from various sources that were directed in the fight against the COVID-19 pandemic. Reports from several countries in Africa indicate that, there has been numerous improper utilizations of public resources earmarked for COVID-19 management. Drawing an example from Kenya, Prof. Lumumba asserted that, a number of scandals were reported on embezzlement of COVID-19 funds, adding further that, there was no transparency displayed in the procurement processes for COVID-19 facilities which led to sizable huge chunk of funds for COVID-19 being, siphoned into the pockets of dishonest and corrupt leaders.

Prof. Lumumba articulated further that, the COVID-19 pandemic has exposed African countries health systems as weak which calls for comprehensive revamping and adequate investment in the health systems to support the poor and marginalized people. He further added that, there was weak leadership displayed by African regional blocks and even at the apex of the African Union in responding to the COVID-19 pandemic, African countries acted in a disorganized manner, that, each country opted to take a different route and approach in dealing with the COVID-19 pandemic, as a result, this paved a way for other nations and other foreign institutions to have a stronger voice on Africa in regard to the COVID-19 pandemic. On her part, Ms. Joyce Nkini-Lwisi, when discussing the key note address, concurred with Prof. Lumumba, commenting on the need for African Leaders to move beyond acting in isolation and work in collaboration. She also described the extent to which African countries were affected by the COVID-19 pandemic, narrating reasons for the different impacts in different countries and their respective responses on COVID-19 pandemic which brought about different outcomes.

### Key issues which emerged from session four;

The key note address and the thoughtful opinions from discussions that followed, resulted into recommendations on several key issues as presented hereunder;

- The countries constituting the East African block should have in place a proper and pragmatic coordination mechanisms which will handle all health issues in the region. This entails among other things, agreeing as a region on specific health matters and take up a uniform stance when addressing such matters.
- There should be a proper mechanism to manage the COVID-19 pandemic on an interregional health systems database approach which will be able to recognize various COVID-19 vaccinations taken in different states within the East Africa region, instead of having multiple uncoordinated health systems which pose considerable costs and stress on the region's citizens.
- ☐ There is an imperative need for African states to adhere and embrace practically the aspect of transparency and accountability in their respective countries, so that, the available resources earmarked for the fight against COVID-19 pandemic should be geared towards supporting lives of the people.

- The COVID 19 pandemic has exposed widely the weaknesses and gaps that exist in various health systems in many African countries. It is therefore advised that, African states should embark on investing in science and technology that will support and cultivate home grown solutions to various health challenges facing the continent.
- □ It is high time that, African states should come together and work as a team to find out lasting solutions to several challenges facing it in the aspect of health, economy and political issues. It is further advised that, African states should be innovative and create their own COVID-19 vaccines pertinent to the African context and environment.



Ms. Sophia Rwegellera Senior Africa Officer from NRGI giving remarks during the ITAC 2021 on 19th November 2021 at Gran Melia Hotel, Arusha.



## SESSION FIVE

### The session highlights - Key note speaker, Discussants and Chairperson



INTERNATIONAL TRANSPARENCY AND ACCOUNTABILITY CONFERENCE 2021

➡ 18-19 NOVEMBER 9 GRA 2021

**Q GRAN MELIÁ HOTEL - ARUSHA** 



Hon. Dr. Dotto Biteko (MP), Minister for Minerals, Tanzania (C) paying attention to CPA. Ludovick Utouh (L) and followed by Ms. Rachael Chagonja, Coordinator, HAKIRASILIMALI (R) during the ITAC 2021 on 19th November 2021 at Gran Melia Hotel, Arusha.

### **Topic:** Becoming more Transparent and Accountable with Public Private Partnership (PPP) initiatives in the extractive sector in Africa.

**The Plenary Panel:** This panel comprised of the key note speaker, Hon. Dr. Dotto Biteko (MP), Minister of Minerals, Tanzania and Ms. Rachael Chagonja, Coordinator, HAKIRASILIMALI who was the discussant. The session was chaired and moderated by CPA Ludovick Utouh, Executive Director, WAJIBU- Institute of Public Accountability and former Controller and Auditor General (CAG) of the United Republic of Tanzania.

### THE OVERVIEW OF PANEL PRESENTATIONS AND ISSUES EMERGED

As indicated above, this session focused on becoming more transparent and accountable with public private partnerships in the extractive sector. The key note speaker for this session was Hon. Dr. Dotto Biteko (MP), Minister for Minerals of the United Republic of Tanzania. Hon. Dr. Biteko began his presentation by expressing his gratitude to the organizers of the conference for inviting him to take part in the ITAC 2021 and more importantly to be among the key note speaker for the conference. He further commended WAJIBU for the superb job done of organizing the historical conference.

In his presentation, he articulated on how the mining sector has become one of the sectors that attracts considerable foreign exchange in the county. Noting further, he said, the government for the past five years has been taking considerable measures including reviewing and enactment of new laws and regulations in order to ensure the country continues to benefit from its natural resources and realize significant proceeds from this sector which will improve the well-being of the people. He further added that, Tanzania has been at the forefront in championing the transparency and accountability agenda by joining the global Extractive Industry Transparency Initiative (EITI) by establishing the Tanzania Extractive Industry Transparency Initiative (TEITI) 2009 and operationalizing the same through the enacted of the TEITI Act of 2015. He also touched on the status of the investment in the sector, by explaining that, Tanzania is still in embryonic stages of large-scale investment in the mining sector and that, integration of the mining sector with other sectors of the economy was the key in ensuring that the country maximizes the benefits to be accrued from its mineral resources. Furthermore, the integration of economic sectors could only be achieved if locals are given opportunities to participate in those sectors, based on this need, Tanzania enacted the National Economic Empowerment Act of 2004 to enable participation of the locals in important sectors of the economy including the mining sector.

Regarding the Public Private Partnership, the Minister pointed out that, the ministry has taken considerable initiatives to facilitate cooperation between the government and the private sector through Public-Private Partnership arrangements, where by the PPP Policy was formulated. It was from that premise that PPP and the government has managed to enter into an agreement with Kabanga Nickel whose official contract will be signed in December 2021 at Sengerema – Mwanza Region and Ngara- Kagera Region.

On her part, Ms. Rachel Chagonja the Executive Director of HAKIRASILIMALI, started by expressing her gratitude to the ITAC 2021 conference organizers and then proceeded to provide her comments as she discussed the Hon. Dr. Biteko's presentation. In her comments, she touched on several concerns as noted in the Minister's address, as follows,

The significant contribution of the mineral sector over the years on Gross Domestic Product (GDP) through revenue collections and other gains from the mining activities.

The initiatives taken by the Ministry and the government at large by implementing the PPP in practice, as reflected in several agreements which Tanzania has been part to or entered into with various private sectors, including the notable agreements with Barrick, Kabanga Nickel and so on.

While recognizing and commending the considerable efforts undertaken by the government in the mining sector, however, she raised several concerns and challenges on the side of the government which seem to tarnish the image of the mining sector as follows;

- i. Lack of transparency in contract disclosure with mining companies, this has remained to be an endless concern of the public and even to leaders particularly Members of Parliament who have repeatedly complained over the secrecy involved in mining contracts,
- ii. How the gains from the mining sector in the county could benefit the common citizen as is done in other countries,
- iii. Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) and its benefits to local communities especially those living near the mining investment areas, together with the implementation of Public Private Partnership law.
- iv. Mining investment companies to list their shares at the Dar es Salaam Stock Exchange (DSE) as per the requirement of Section 156 of the Mining Act; however, with the new regulations in place which have waived the requirement for new Public Private Partnership undertakings in the mining sector to list at the Dar es Salaam Stock Exchange,
- Furthermore, the she advised that, as the country aims at attracting new investment, it will be worthwhile to take into consideration the following. -

- Conducting a comprehensive assessment of the impact of new arrangements to other mining companies operating in Tanzania.
- Contradictions arising from new laws governing the sector towards management of raw mineral resources (makinikia)
- Financial modeling equation for sharing of anticipated revenue from TWIGA and Tembo joint ventures.
- ☐ Finally, she proposed the following recommendations for improvement of the mining sector; -
  - Working on increasing government stake in new joint ventures
  - $\circ$  Ensuring there is enforcement of the law and regulations
  - Conduct further research and analysis on revenue management and collection from joint ventures, local content and Corporate Social Responsibility and geological data.

#### Key issues and responses which emerged from Session Five

Most of the issues described hereunder, include responses by the Hon, Minster for Mining, Dr. Dotto Biteko (MP) and the comments, responses and comments raised by the discussant and participants during the discussions of the session; -

☐ In response to the concerns and challenges raised by the discussant and participants, the Hon. Minister articulated that, the joint ventures entered into through Public Private Partnership arrangement have led to increased government revenue, from about 140 million shillings collected in 2020 to more than 500 million shillings collected in 2021.

- Regarding non-disclosure and secrecy of mining contracts, the Hon. Minister expressed the need for contracting parties to agree on which issues should be made public, within the ambit of the law.
- The Minister further noted on role of Parliament as an oversight organ of the state and ascertained, that, the Parliament is involved through discussions of the completed contracts and that the law empowers it to request the government to submit anything relating to contracts for Parliamentary scrutiny should it so desire.
- ☐ The Hon. Minister added that, the government has registered notable achievement on joint venture undertakings and that, at the moment, the government already has 16% free carried interest shares in the mining companies which gives the government the right of a seat within the company's boards of directors.
- The Hon. Minister also commented on the TEITI reports, noting that, the country is now current in its reports, and that the last report shows a non-significant discrepancy of less than 1%,
- □ Commenting on the question of local content, he stated that, the Local Content Regulations requires the companies involved to be totally local and currently many companies providing goods and services in the sector are 100% local companies. On the CSR and local content, the law is clear that at least there must be participation of locals by 20%.
- □ Responding to the concern over raw mineral resources "Makinikia", the Hon. Minister commented that, the government has now been able to identify and differentiate what is raw mineral, final products and what is value addition;

that, the value addition means that the raw minerals have been further processed to add value. Therefore, the government has taken measures in making sure that concentrates are valued according to the content of the same (in terms on minerals contained).

□ Clarifying on regional mining policy harmonization, the Hon. Minister stated that, on harmonization efforts with the Great Lakes Region, the effort should be initiated by Africans themselves not otherwise, commenting that, Tanzania has initiated the Tanzania International Mining Conference to be conducted annually which aims to bring together African players in the sector. However, the legal reform efforts undertaken by Tanzania have inspired other countries in the region to do the same, such as DRC, Burundi, and Mozambique and so on.

### **Breakaway Sessions Day Two**

These breakaway sessions followed the conclusion of the main plenary session and tea break. The breakaway sessions were held in different rooms but they all ran concurrently centering on various topics of interest. As in the previous sessions, the breakaway sessions provided platforms for ITAC participants to attend sessions of their choice and interest; this was unique platforms for participants to interact with experienced speakers and sharing experiences with their fellow participants. This section of the report is therefore, intended to provide in brief what transpired in those respective sessions, including speakers, topics covered and key issues which emerged during the sessions.

### **BREAKAWAY SESSION 02A**

### Topic: Budget transparency and inclusiveness of citizen participation at the Local Government level

**The Session Panel**: The panel for this session involved Mr. Florian Schweitzer, Head of Public Finance Governance Programme, from SIKIKA, Tanzania, who participated as the key note speaker, Chaired by Mr. Francis Uhadi from the Foundation for Civil Society – Tanzania.

#### The Overview of the presentation and key issues noted

The budget transparency and inclusiveness of citizen participation at the local government level is key to enable citizens taking an active role in planning, implementation and monitoring of the use of public resources for the betterment of all citizens and the country at large. It further entails carrying out an open and transparent budget process by engaging with citizens at the Local Government levels in accordance with the existing laws and policies.

To measure the level of budget transparency and citizens participation at local levels, SIKIKA presented the result of a survey which was carried out with an intent to identify national best practice standards and promote peer-learning among local authorities by using a tool known as Sub National Open Budget Survey (SNOBS). The tool aims at assessing four aspects including, timely availability of budgetary information to citizens, quality of the mechanisms utilised for disseminating the budgetary information to citizens, establishment of channels for citizens to participate in the review and oversight of budgetary documents and clarity and relevance of the information included in the main budgetary reports available to citizens at the subnational level.

The brief results of seven surveyed LGAs from different regions indicated that the level of citizens participation was very low in all aspects, that, citizen participation was inclusive but limited in scope, in the sense that, citizens were only involved in small community initiatives but not in the planning process of large-scale initiatives of the Local Government Authority. Also, public procurement and service delivery oversight do not systematically involve citizens.

#### Key issues noted which emerged from the session:

Several issues were noted in the course of the deliberations in the session which include among others, the following;

- There are considerable opportunities available for CSOs to strengthen citizen participation and transparency at the local level through preparations of simple and friendly documents, such as, pamphlets, leaflets, fliers or brochures made in a simple language for easy understanding by common citizens which describes the budget process.
- □ Local Government leaders' awareness and capacity need to be capacitated to enable them competently to handle budgetary issues and see the importance of engaging citizens in the council's budgetary process.
- ☐ There is a need for CSOs to improve their advocacy approaches so that they can reach adequate areas and leaders at different levels of local government authorities.
- CSOs to engage in promoting citizen participation in the budget process, using Social Accountability Monitoring tool to empower citizens to use available budget information in the budget process.

### **BREAKAWAY SESSION TWO:**

### Topic: What are the ingredients necessary for building a Healthy Society amidst COVID-19 pandemic?

**The Session Panel:** The panel was comprised of Dr. Florence Temu, Country Director of Amref Health Africa Tanzania, who delivered the key note address and Ms. Clara Mollay, Nutritionist from Mount-Meru Hospital who played the role of moderator and discussant of the session.

#### The Overview of the presentation and key issues noted

This session was geared towards providing and increasing knowledge of participants on matters pertaining to nutrition's options for healthy diet in the fight against the COVID -19 pandemic. The presenter begun by defining health and then went on to describe that it means a healthy society. In defining health, the presenter said, Health according to the World Health Organization (WHO), it means a state of complete physical, mental and social well-being and not merely the absence of disease and infirmity.

On the other hand, a healthy society encompasses considerable elements, which are more than preventing injuries, diseases and reducing deaths from disease. It further includes access to safe neighborhoods and affordable housing, broadening job opportunities and reducing income inequality, designing walkable towns and fostering community cohesion. The presenter further spoke on the impact of COVID-19 on healthy society, that, the COVID-19 pandemic has interrupted one or more essential health services and poses major health threats beyond the disease itself, adding that, COVID-19 has caused more hardships and burden on people particularly on the

poor. The data shows that, the pandemic if not addressed over 70 million people will be pushed into extreme poverty mostly from Low and Middle-Income Countries.

The presenter further urged participants to adhere to the health guidelines issued by the government and WHO and take all precautionary measures, stressing that, COVID-19, can affect anybody irrespective of one's status.

#### Key issues noted which emerged from the session

During the presentation and discussions, the following key issues were noted:

- Everyone has a duty and responsibility to protect him/herself and protect others against COVID-19, that, statistics show that, between 3<sup>rd</sup> January 2020 and 17<sup>th</sup> November 2021, 26,227 confirmed cases of COVID-19 were registered and 727 deaths, reported to WHO.
- Physical activities are recommended to avoid or protect oneself against COVID-19, as it helps to balance the body and boost up body immunities, hence, an individual is recommended to engage in physical workout or activities for at least 30 minutes' daily
- It's advised to take at least 8 to 10 glasses of water daily to keep the body in good shape and healthy
- ☐ Health diet is essential for stronger body immunity, that, it is advised to eat variety of foods with all ingredients as required daily.
- □ It is encouraged to prepare your own meals rather than eating at restaurants frequently, as the food prepared at the restaurants may not include all the ingredients required as a balanced diet.

### **BREAKAWAY SESSION THREE**

### Topic: 2021 Resource Governance Index (RGI) for Tanzania's Mining and Oil & Gas Sector

**The Session Panel:** The key note speaker for this session was Ms. Sophia Rwegellera Senior Africa Officer from NRGI and was chaired and moderated by Ms. Rehema Tukai - Program Lead - Strengthening Civil Society - Norwegian Church Aid.

#### Overview of the presentation and key issues noted

This presentation overview was presented by the Natural Resource Governance Institute (NRGI) during the breakaway session; the NRGI presented the findings of the Resource Governance Index (RGI) for Tanzania's oil and gas and mining sectors which was launched earlier in 2021. NRGI has assessed how 18 resource-rich countries govern their oil, gas and mineral wealth. The index composite score is made up of three components. Two components measure key characteristics of the extractives sector - value realization and revenue management - and a third component captures the broader context of governance — the enabling environment. These three overarching dimensions of governance consist of 14 subcomponents, which comprise 51 indicators, which are calculated by aggregating 136 questions. In her presentation, Ms. Rwegellera began by articulating about the Resource Governance Index (RGI) and its measure, whereby, she narrated in brief that, RGI measures the quality of the legal framework and the implementation of laws and rules in practice, explaining further that, RGI cannot measure policy outcomes, such as quality, success or appropriateness of policies; context-based or external factors.

Presenting the summary of the Tanzania 2021 Resource Governance Index (RGI), Ms. Rwegellera touched on the results in the mining sector as well as in the Oil and Gas sector as follows,

- The mining sector indicated to have scored a total of 58 out of 100, whereas the Oil and gas sector scored 55 out of 100. Articulating on this, she mentioned that, calculating the RGI is done through its framework, whereby the composite score is an aggregate of three components which include value realization, revenue management and enabling environment. The value realization and revenue management cover the key policy areas that RGI works on which are obtained through questionnaires. Thus, enabling environment covers the broader governance context and is sourced from external data.
- That, the two extractive sector components consist of indicators which measure either law or practice, the difference between average scores of all law indicators and all practice indicators forms the gap between written rules and enforcement in a given country
- The key RGI scores and findings are comprehensively provided and well elaborated in the respective Tanzania RGI report, which can be found on the NRGI channels including in its website https://resourcegovernance.org/analysis-tools/ publications/2021-resource-governance-index

#### Key issues noted which emerged from the session.

The key issues highlighted in this part represent comments, responses and recommendations from the speakers and participants during the session as addressed hereunder; -

NRGI should ensure the RGI findings are disseminated at the community level through simple and friendly language so as to enable the citizens to obtain the knowledge

- NRGI should seek more clarification from the ministry and obtain more recent and practical information instead of relying only on the information obtained on the internet to get a clearer picture of the real situation.
- It was further observed that, the Tanzania budget for the Ministry of Minerals for the year 2020/21 had substantially increased and the Ministry was in actual fact allocated even more funds, which suggests that the Ministry's budget was satisfactory. However, satisfactory could be more debated on what exactly it means, hence, RGI needed to make more sense out of that.

### PLENARY DISCUSSION - DEBRIFING BY BREAKAWAY SESSIONS CHAIRS

This plenary discussion followed the conclusion of the breakaway sessions. This debriefing session was designed to provide chairs who presided over different breakaways sessions with a platform to present in a nut shell what was agreed in their respective breakaway sessions. The overall objective of the plenary discussions was to share key issues and messages which emerged in different breakaway sessions with the rest of the participants who had attended different breakaway sessions. During the plenary session, each presiding chair had some few minutes to present before the audience on key issues which were discussed and agreed under their given topics. The key issues presented by the chairs in the plenary discussions, have been presented above under the category of key issues emerged. The next event which followed the end of the plenary session was the official closing ceremony of ITAC 2021.



Ms. Sophia Rwegellera Senior Africa Officer from NRGI giving remarks during the ITAC 2021 on 19th November 2021 at Gran Melia Hotel, Arusha.

### **CLOSING SESSION**

Closing session activity marked the official conclusion of the two days' ITAC 2021. This session was conducted after all planned conference activities were carried out. In this session, two main activities were conducted, to include, a vote of thanks accompanied by conference takeaway points from the WAJIBU Executive Director, CPA Ludovick Utouh and closing speech as delivered by the Guest of Honour, Hon. Dr. Dotto Biteko (MP), Minister for Mineral – United Republic of Tanzania (URT).

### A vote of thanks and concluding remarks from WAJIBU Executive Director

Concluding remarks were conveyed by the Executive Director of WAJIBU, who began by expressing his gratitude and appreciation to different stakeholders including the development partners whose support and dedication made the ITAC 2021 a reality. He extended his deep appreciation to the Regional Commissioner of Arusha, Hon. John Mongela for officiating the opening of ITAC 2021. He further conveyed his appreciation to Hon, Dr. Dotto Biteko (MP), Minister for Minerals of the URT for accepting to attend ITAC 2021, making a presentation on the mining sector and officiating the closing of the conference. Moreover, he thanked the Hon. Mrisho Gambo (MP) Member of Parliament for Arusha constituency for attending the ITAC 2021, as well as, the WAJIBU Board of Directors. Staffs. Key note Speakers, Discussants, Chairs, Rapportues, Media and all participants hailing from different parts of the country and outside the country. He eventually, read out the conference takeaway<sup>1</sup> points and thereafter, invited the Chief Guest to officiate the closing of the ITAC 2021 conference.





Hon. Dr. Dotto Biteko (MP), Minister for Minerals, Tanzania giving his closing speech during the ITAC 2021 on 19th November 2021 at Gran Melia Hotel, Arusha.

#### Closing speech by guest of honor

Upon taking the floor, the guest of honor, Hon. Dr. Dotto Biteko (MP) Minister for Minerals, reiterated his appreciation for being invited and commended WAJIBU – Institute of Public Accountability for organizing the International Transparency and Accountability Conference (ITAC 2021). He further dwelt into the theme of the conference where he emphasized on the need for a country and its people to embrace the culture of transparency and accountability to build a responsible and accountable society.

Hon. Minister went further to stress that, transparency and accountability was the way to go if all we desire to see a nation that is responsible, accountable and progressive. Quoting Bishop Kisare's words, he emphasized that, transparency and accountability is not a human made agenda but rather an agenda from God himself. He further underscored the importance of accountability in a country as a constitutional requirement which confer responsibilities to the country and the people as enshrined under Article 8 (c); Article 9 (i); and Article 27 (2) of the constitution of the United Republic of Tanzania of 1977 (as amended from time to time).

Finally, He urged participants to take precautionary measures against COVID-19 pandemic and encouraged them to also take pragmatic steps in accepting the COVID-19 vaccines.

These remarks by the Hon. Guest of Honour, Dr. Dotto Biteko (MP) conclusively, brought the ITAC 2021 to a closure until the next ITAC 2022 conference.

#### THE MASTERCLASS (EXPERIENCE SHARING)

The evening master class was a free-styled session conducted in the evening of the second day of the ITAC 2021. The session was deliberately organized for creating a platform for interaction and experience sharing among participants, presenters, CSOs leaders and representative officials from the government. During this session, CSOs leaders from different organizations such as WAJIBU, NCA, HAKIRASILIMALI, Policy Forum, and senior officers from NAOT and PCCB had an opportunity to share their experiences and challenges with participants on issues related to the engagement with various stakeholders on financial accountability matters. The session equally provided a room for participants particularly from FBOs, CBOs, NGOs, and academia, to ask questions and obtained clarifications on the respective concerns from the experts on accountability in the country.

### Annexes

ITAC 2021 Conference Takeaways.

### TAKAWAY POINTS FOR THE INTERNATIONAL TRANSPARENCY AND ACCOUNTABILITY CONFERENCE (ITAC 2021) HELD FROM 18-19 NOVEMBER, 2021 GRAN MELIA HOTEL IN ARUSHA

#### The take away points to the Government are as follows;

The following steps towards building the total culture of transparency and accountability that government should consider;

- 1. Government is strongly urged to have strong and independent oversight institutions to enhance transparency and accountability in the country,
- 2. Government should adopt modern audit techniques which will take into consideration aspects of technological transformation, which are compatible with the local situation,
- 3. Parliamentary Oversight Committees, particularly the Budget Committee, the Public Accounts Committee (PAC), Public Investment Committee (PIC) and Local Authorities Accounts Committee (LAAC) should continue to emphasize on the timely implementation of the CAG's recommendations accordingly by the duty bearers,
- 4. Government is urged to facilitate broader mechanisms of participation by involving different groups in the society in the designing stage, implementation and evaluation of the strategic development projects,

- 5. Government is advised to ensure that funds are timely disbursed to the respective entities, as per the approved budget and that funds are properly managed,
- 6. Government is urged to enhance transparency of financial information to increase trust to investors and promote competitiveness in the global market,
- 7. Government is advised to encourage transparency in revenue collection and expenditures to increase public trust and confidence, which in turn can reduce corruption.

#### The take away points to the CSOs are as follows;

#### **Civil Society Organization**

- 1. CSOs should build capacity of both citizens and the Government officials on public financial accountability to improve management of public resources to benefit all citizens,
- 2. CSOs should come up with creative and accountable advocacy strategies that will enhance the effective collaboration with the Government,
- 3. CSOs are advised to create, design and establish interventions that are geared towards promoting ethical values, leadership and patriotism to citizens particularly those at an early age to build the culture of transparency and accountability in the country.
- 4. NRGI and WAJIBU are urgently urged to organize a working session of stakeholders of the Mining and Energy sectors to review the 2021 RGI Index presented in the conference.

### The take away points to Citizens are as follows;

Citizens as the ultimate owners of the public resources should be in the forefront of demanding for transparency and accountability on the management of public resources.

- 1. Citizens should take an active role to participate in public meetings and demand accountability from their respective leaders.
- 2. Citizens should Invest heavily in building social morals, ethics and values of families to become more responsible citizens with the fear of God.
- 3. Citizens should be encouraged to pay taxes and demand for proper accountability of the public resource collected.
- 4. Citizens should ensure that they elect competent and corrupt free leaders who will be able to address and attend to their issues, and take stock of their deeds/promises.

### **Evaluation of the Conference**

The evaluation of ITAC 2021 was undertaken toward the end of the conference through an evaluation form which was filled by 45% of the participants. A total of 114 (66 Male and 48 Female) participants provided their views on the followings:

### **Overall Assessment of the conference**

Based on the analysis, the overall assessment of the conference was categorized by numbers, in which 1: Insufficient, 2: Sufficient, 3: Good, 4: Very Good, 5: Excellent.

The highest score is number 5 which is excellent equivalent to 65%.

Figure 1: Overall Assessment of the Conference

In analyzing the evaluators evaluation forms, it was observed that all topics presented were found to have been useful but the most interesting topic was topic No. 2: *"Financial Transparency and Accountability as a Tool for African Countries to achieve sustainable competitive advantage in the global economy"*.

### **Figure 2: Assessment of the Conference Topics**

Overall, based on the analysis of the conference, the conference objectives were attained by 96%, where as 93% of participants acknowledged to have gained knowledge and information provided in the conference and 68% of the participants committed themselves to use/apply the knowledge obtained in their accountability work.

### Participants provided their views on what should be improved in the next ITAC 2022:

- Swahili translation aide should be considered,
- Increase number of conference days up to 3 days,
- ☐ The conference should use more participatory methods, by engaging participation of audience much more, breakaway sessions should involve group discussions,
- Involve more international players in the presentations for experience sharing,
- Invite decision makers to balance the discussions and to offer current feedback,

- ☐ Time management for the sessions, by reducing time of the presentation and providing more time for experience sharing, learning and networking,
- Include more youths so that they can acquire more knowledge in the conference,

#### **General Comments / suggestions**

- □ ITAC should be conducted annually,
- Breakaway Session O2A on "Budget transparency and inclusive citizen participation at the Local Government level" was the most informative and transformative topic,
- The theme of ITAC 2022 is suggested to be, "Enhancing transparency and accountability in the budget process at all levels",
- ITAC 2022, should include more topics on civil engagement and participation including training on resource mobilization and work philanthropy,
- □ ITAC 2022, should discuss the country's education system to include accountability issues from the grassroots level,
- WAJIBU should involve more people with disability in the ITAC 2022,
- Topics on leadership and gender should be included in ITAC 2022,
- ITAC should be conducted on 28<sup>th</sup> September of each year, in celebration of the global transparency day which is celebrated on the 28<sup>th</sup> September each year.

Plot No. 363, Block B' Mikocheni House No. 10 P.O. Box 13486 Dar es Salaam - Tanzania T: +255 736 666 916 E: wajibu.institute@gmail.com W: www.wajibu.or.tz

**f** WAJIBU-INSTITUTE

**O** Wajibu\_institute

